# EXHIBIT 4

#### IRELL & MANELLA LLP

A REGISTERED LIMITED LIABILITY LAW PARTNERSHIP INCLUDING PROFESSIONAL CORPORATIONS

840 NEWPORT CENTER DRIVE, SUITE 400 NEWPORT BEACH, CA 92660-6324 TELEPHONE (949) 760-0991 FACSIMIE (949) 760-5200 1800 AVENUE OF THE STARS, SUITE 900 LOS ANGELES, CALIFORNIA 90067-4276

TELEPHONE (310) 277-1010 FACSIMILE (310) 203-7199 WEBSITE: www.irell.com

WRITER'S DIRECT
TELEPHONE (310) 203-7106
FACSIMILE (310) 556-5206
doindler@irell.com

September 10, 2004

# **VIA E-MAIL**

To: Counsel of Record for Plaintiffs\*

Re: <u>In re Columbia University Patent Litigation, MDL No. 1592</u>

#### Dear Counsel:

I am writing to follow up on our telephone conference of September 7, 2004, regarding the scope of the Covenant Not to Sue that Columbia filed on September 1, 2004 ("Covenant"). At the suggestion of the Court, I am memorializing the clarifications that we provided during our telephone conference.

- 1. The Covenant applies to any claim of any reissued or reexamined version of the '275 patent that is the same as, or substantially identical to, a claim of the '275 patent as it currently reads. The term "substantially identical" is intended to have the same meaning as that term is used in 35 U.S.C. § 252. The Covenant does not apply to any other claim of any reissued or reexamined version of the '275 patent.
- 2. The Covenant applies to any product currently made, used, offered for sale, sold, or imported by plaintiffs, or any product that was made, used, offered for sale, sold, or imported by plaintiffs prior to the date of the Covenant. Thus, by way of example, Rituxan is a product currently made and sold by Genentech. Columbia will not sue Genentech for infringement of the '275 patent as it currently reads, or seek royalties under the license agreement on the basis of the '275 patent as it currently reads, with respect to Rituxan at any time now or in the future.
- 3. The Covenant applies only to plaintiffs in the pending actions. The Covenant does not apply to their affiliates or customers.
- 4. The Covenant does not apply to any claim in any patent that may issue in the future based upon the pending '159 application, irrespective of whether plaintiffs contend that such claim is the same as, or substantially identical to, a claim of the '275 patent as it currently reads.

Page 3 of 4

# IRELL & MANELLA LLP

A REGISTERED LIMITED LIABILITY LAW PARTNERSHIP INCLUDING PROFESSIONAL CORPORATIONS

Counsel of Record for Plaintiffs\* September 10, 2004 Page 2

During our telephone conference on September 7, plaintiffs also inquired whether Columbia was maintaining the position that their license agreements have been terminated. We will address that issue in a separate letter.

If you have any additional questions concerning the scope of the Covenant, please do not hesitate to contact me.

Very truly yours,

David I. Gindler

cc: Wayne Barsky, Esq.

## \*Counsel of Record for Plaintiffs

Adrian M. Pruetz, Esq.
Quinn Emanuel Urquhart Oliver & Hedges, LLP
865 S. Figueroa St.
10th Floor
Los Angeles, CA 90017
COUNSEL FOR GENENTECH, INC.

Donald Ware, Esq.
Foley Hoag LLP
155 Seaport Blvd.
Boston, MA 02210
COUNSEL FOR BIOGEN IDEC MA, INC. AND GENZYME CORP.

Mark A. Pals, Esq.
Kirkland & Ellis LLP
Aon Building
200 East Randolph Dr.
Chicago, IL 60601
COUNSEL FOR ABBOTT BIORESEARCH CENTER, INC.

## IRELL & MANELLA LLP

A REGISTERED LIMITED LIABILITY LAW PARTNERSHIP INCLUDING PROFESSIONAL CORPORATIONS

Counsel of Record for Plaintiffs\* September 10, 2004 Page 3

Leora Ben-Ami, Esq.
Kaye Scholer LLP
425 Park Ave.
New York, NY 10022-7203
COUNSEL FOR WYETH AND GENETICS INSTITUTE LLC

Steven A. Zalesin, Esq.
Patterson, Belknap, Webb & Tyler LLP
1133 Avenue of the Americas
New York, NY 10036
COUNSEL FOR JOHNSON & JOHNSON

Vicki G. Norton, Esq. Wilson, Sonsini, Goodrich & Rosati 3611 Valley Centre Drive San Diego, CA 92130

Eileen M. Hurlihy, Esq.
Palmer & Dodge
111 Huntington Ave.
Boston, MA 02199
COUNSEL FOR AMGEN INC. AND IMMUNEX CORP.